

88/2016

August 25, 2016

*Cristina Ariza Cerezo**

The ideological landscape in the
US: the case of the Foreign
Affairs Policy Board

[Visit the WEB](#)

[Subscribe to NEWSLETTER](#)

The ideological landscape in the US: the case of the Foreign Affairs Policy Board

Abstract

The Foreign Affairs Policy Board is an advisory body to the U.S. administration that comprises a very renowned membership with background in both academia and government. Although the board has only an advisory role, it is a model example of the ideas that currently shape the ideological landscape in the US. This paper will examine the members' political leanings and how they mirror Obama's foreign policy. As the presidential primaries between Hillary Clinton and Donald Trump approach, this paper also attempts to give some insights into the future of the board.

Keywords: United States, Foreign Affairs Policy Board, Obama, Neoconservatives, Liberals, Syria, Ukraine, Kagan, Nye, Trump, Clinton.

***NOTA:** Las ideas contenidas en los **Documentos de Opinión** son de responsabilidad de sus autores, sin que reflejen, necesariamente, el pensamiento del IEEE o del Ministerio de Defensa.

Introduction: The Foreign Affairs Policy Board (FAPB)

The Foreign Affairs Policy Board is an advisory body to the United States administration composed of a very renowned membership with background in academia, military, government and the private sector. Created by John Kerry in 2013, it provides the government with a benchmark on key foreign policy issues on which expertise is very much needed. Of course, members' recommendations have a very limited scope due to the very nature of the board. In some way, it aims to connect cross-cutting areas of knowledge regarding foreign policy. Setting a network of experts also helps to create a source of shared wisdom from which to draw as new challenges emerge in the international arena.

The board currently has 23 members who have been replaced once, although the president, Strobe Talbott, and some key members (Stephen Hadley, Jane Harman, Carla Hills, Robert Kagan, Michael Mullen, Vali Nasr, John Negroponte, Thomas Pickering y Anne-Marie Slaughter) have been in the FAPB since it was founded. It is important to note, as Laurence Shoup¹ points out, that the American think tank Council of Foreign Relations (CFR) has a major voice in the board, since most members belong or have belonged to it. On the whole, a significant part of the FAPB is intrinsically linked to academia.

This paper intends to offer a comprehensive analysis on the Foreign Affairs Policy Board, with the ultimate goal of assessing which political ideas are more relevant and whether they mirror Obama's foreign policy. Moreover, the paper seeks to make a profile of the membership of this board so that it is possible to look for equivalents in other countries and further expand the scope of analysis. Finally, the paper also reflects on the future of the board in light of the presidential primaries that will take place during the next months, which will see Donald Trump facing Hillary Clinton.

Ideological leanings within the FAPB: Republicans and Democrats

Most members of the Foreign Affairs Policy Board are men (78%) with background in government² (91%), academia (61%), the private sector (35%) and the military (13%). As shown in the table at the end of the document— drawn up with information

¹ SHOUP Laurence, *Wall Street's Think Tank: The Council on Foreign Relations and the Empire of Neoliberal Geopolitics, 1976-2014*, Monthly Review Press, 2015.

² 'Academia' comprises both jobs in the university and think tanks, while ambassadors, congressmen and other government posts fall into the category 'government'. Those who have joined the military have been considered as a separate category. Moreover, the category 'private sector' includes lawyers, journalists and economists. However, in the table at the end of the document 'academia' is used only in reference to universities; it is specified if they have worked in think tanks or similar posts. Categories are not exclusive.

from the Secretary of State of the U.S. Administration—,³ members share common interests and have similar backgrounds.

This table helps create a profile that summarises the professional background of advisors to the U.S. government; so it can be further built upon with counterparts in other regions in order to look at the big picture of the most influential political ideas. Regarding education, a high percentage has gone on to postgraduate study (61%). The most popular degree is Political Science (43%), followed by Law (35%), History (26%), International Relations (22%) and Economics (9%). Moreover, most members have even attended the same universities, with Ivy-League universities clearly in the lead (Yale (26%), Harvard (26%), Princeton (9%), Columbia, Brown, Pennsylvania and Cornell). Some other relevant institutions are Tufts Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy (13%) and John Hopkins School of Advanced International Studies (SAIS). Some candidates have even studied abroad, especially in Europe, in universities such as Oxford (17%), School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS), University of Munich or University of Melbourne. This profile suggests that some of the members already knew each other from having frequented the same academic circles, both at universities and think tanks, which signifies the importance of the political ideas that they subscribe to. Although, as it has already been pointed out, the decision-making power of the members of the FAPB is very limited, one can make the argument that they are at least representative of the most important current political ideas in both government and academia.

In terms of workplaces, around 43% of the members belong to the Council of Foreign Relations (CFR). It is also worth noting that some members work or have worked at the same institutions: Aspen Strategy Group (22%), American Security Project (9%), Mc Larty Associates (9%), Carnegie Endowment for International Peace (13%), Brookings Institution (13%) or Harvard Kennedy School (13%). The fact that members know each other personally and have similar interests does not prevent the board from choosing from different backgrounds. Although most are experts on foreign policy and security (78%), there are also experts on other fields, such as economy, education and international law. The criteria that has been followed for the selection of candidates underlines the importance of having all sorts of regional advisors in this type of board; thus we find experts on Africa, the Middle East, Russia, the European Union, Japan, China, Vietnam or Latin America. Furthermore, the last name of the list is David Wade, John Kerry's personal advisor, which shows how important it is for decision-makers to surround themselves with people they trust, beyond a particular professional or academic profile.

³ US DEPARTMENT OF STATE, 'Foreign Affairs Policy Board- Current Board Members' Available at: <http://www.state.gov/s/p/fapb/c50662.htm>

Neoconservatives and Republicans: Robert Kagan

The ideological construct of the Republican Party draws from several sources that have defined the conservative movement in the last decades. One of the most important factions is the Christian Right movement, which was founded on the premise that they were going to reform divorce laws, oppose abortion, euthanasia and the demands of gay activists and improve taxes for families⁴. According to José María Marco, another important ideology is the Old Right or paleoconservatism, which advocates that the U.S. should become isolationist and stop intervening in the internal affairs of other states, since it is not the nation's duty to safeguard freedom and democracy in the world⁵. More recently, the Tea Party—movement built upon Judeo-Christian values that claims for a strong military, tenancy of arms, ending deficit spending and downsizing government⁶— has seen its influence increase within the Republican Party, despite its claims that it also is comprised of Democrats and Libertarians.

Neoconservatism, exemplified in the foreign policy of George W. Bush and his decision to invade Iraq, stands as one of the more controversial political movements within the Republican Party. Neoconservatism has a very important moral component and clearly distinguishes between 'good' and 'evil', or in political terms, between 'democracy' and 'tyranny'⁷. Therefore, the U.S. government should fight for establishing itself as the hegemonic nation and should not shy away from promoting regime change in those countries where democracy is not the rule. It is strongly rooted in patriotism and in U.S. fundamental values: freedom, equality before the law and democracy.

While this movement has lost some of its appeal because of the fiascos in Afghanistan and especially Iraq, it still retains some influence within some circles. In fact, Robert Kagan, one of the main exponents of the neocons and also a member of the FAPB, still does not refrain from hoisting the flag of U.S. hegemony to defend the idea that his nation must guarantee the balance of power in the liberal international order, although his approach is more cautious as a result of the many failures of the war on terror⁸. Other members who could also be considered neocons include Stephen Hadley, a Bush advisor during his second administration and chief of the

⁴ MARCO José María, *La nueva revolución americana: El movimiento liberal conservador en Estados Unidos (1968-2006)*, 2012, p.73

⁵ *Ibid*, p. 142.

⁶ TEA PARTY, 'About us', available at: <http://www.teaparty.org/about-us/>

⁷ FOONG KONG Yuen, *Neoconservatism and the domestic sources of American foreign policy*, en SMITH Steve, HADFIELD Amelia y DUNNE TIM, *Foreign Policy Theories, Actors, Cases*, Oxford University Press, 2008, p.251-264

⁸ KAGAN Robert, 'Superpowers don't get to retire', Brookings, 26 May 2015, available at: <http://www.brookings.edu/research/opinions/2014/05/26-superpowers-dont-retire-kagan>

U.S. strategy in Iraq from 2007. John Negroponte has been defined as a 'conservative', but he is just not as far to the right as neocons⁹.

Notwithstanding, Donald Trump, the Republican candidate to the primaries, has firmly stood against neocons, thus fostering a divide within the Party. He has criticised Barack Obama just as much he has attacked George W. Bush, in a reminiscent way of how the 'left' or some sectors of the Democrats condemned Bush's legacy. We should bear in mind that it was in fact the 'New Left'—isolationist—the one that rallied against the intervention in Iraq¹⁰. Given the current international context, neoconservatism does not seem to experience a rebirth in the U.S. political arena but rather the opposite.

Liberals and Democrats: Joseph Nye

The Democratic Party is also host to many different ideologies. The most progressive movement within the Democrats has adopted the ideology of progressive left-wing Europeans, according to José María Marco, but it has also received a lot of backlash from the rest of the party. Then came the Centrist Democrats, who pushed for '*deficit contention, fiscal austerity, opening national markets and increasing defence spending*'¹¹. Bill Clinton and Hillary Clinton could fall into this category, same as some members of the FAPB like Nicholas Burns. Liberals, who are placed more to the left than centrists on social issues such as abortion, equal marriage and regularisation of illegal migrants, comprise another noteworthy ideology¹². They also defend a lesser role of the army. While some argue that Obama's policy is centrist¹³, it definitely fits better with liberalism¹⁴.

The weight of liberals in their own party is very limited. According to some studies, only 43% of Democrats consider themselves liberal, while about 70% of Republicans consider themselves conservatives¹⁵. It is important to bear in mind the explicit

⁹ CAMPBELL Duncan, 'Veteran of dirty wars wins lead US spy role', The Guardian, 18 February 2005, available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2005/feb/18/usa.duncancampbell>,

¹⁰ MARCO José María, op.cit., p.142

¹¹ Ibid, p. 399

¹² KOHUT Andrew, 'Are the Democrats getting too liberal?', Washington Post, 28 February 2014, available at: https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/are-the-democrats-getting-too-liberal/2014/02/28/c0d42d7c-8d26-11e3-95dd-36ff657a4dae_story.html

¹³ Ibid

¹⁴ KRAUSHAAR JOSH, 'Time for Truth in Labeling: Obama Is Not Centrist', The Atlantic, 11 March 2014, available at: <http://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2014/03/time-for-truth-in-labeling-obama-is-not-centrist/448956/>

¹⁵ BALL Molly, 'No, Liberals Don't Control the Democratic Party', The Atlantic, 7 February 2014, available at: <http://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2014/02/no-liberals-dont-control-the-democratic-party/283653/>

vagueness in the definition of conservatism and liberalism, which can roughly be equated to 'right-wing' and 'left-wing' in Europe¹⁶. Identifying as a conservative, liberal or moderate does not imply allegiance to one party or the other, since there are liberal factions within the Republican Party and conservative factions within the Democratic Party.

Finally, the neoconservative movement finds its Democratic counterpart in liberal interventionism, with which it shares the moral imperative to promote freedom in the world. However, liberal interventionists believe that other countries should also contribute to this effort¹⁷, since they have the utmost respect for multilateralism and international law¹⁸. Anne-Marie Slaughter could fit this description¹⁹. Nonetheless, it is important to note that military interventions are still a bone of contention for both Republicans and Democrats.

Among those chosen to comprise the FAPB, Joseph Nye certainly stands out. He initially gained recognition from giving birth to the neoliberal theory of international relations and the concept of soft power. In 2014, Foreign Policy²⁰ defined him as one of the most influential figures in the U.S. both in academia and government. His understanding of foreign policy is very similar to Obama's, especially on the importance of limiting military power, as he argues that many problems *'cannot be fixed through traditional hard power. For example, military power is of little help on climate change, pandemics or governance of the Internet'*²¹. Nicholas Burns agrees that soft power should be a key tool for maintaining U.S. hegemony in the future²².

Apart from Nye's ideas, feminism is another important movement within the FAPB to which both Anne-Marie Slaughter and Anne Finucane subscribe, same as Hillary Clinton, who has invoked feminism in several times. Some analysts argue that in the

¹⁶ MARCO, op.cit. p.78

¹⁷ BOSCO David, 'What divides neocons and liberal interventionists', Foreign Policy, 9 April 2012, available at: <http://foreignpolicy.com/2012/04/09/what-divides-neocons-and-liberal-interventionists/>

¹⁸ Ibid

¹⁹ BREYMAN Steve, 'The Aptly Named Anne-Marie Slaughter', Truth Out, 24 May 2014, available at: <http://www.truth-out.org/opinion/item/23921-the-aptly-named-anne-marie-slaughter>

²⁰ RICKS Thomas 'Who are the top international relations specialist?', Foreign Policy, 25 September 2014, available at: <http://foreignpolicy.com/2014/09/25/who-are-the-top-international-relations-specialists-surprise-scholars-have-a-very-different-view-than-policymakers-do/>

²¹ NYE Joseph, 'Politicians say American leadership is in decline. They're wrong', Washington Post, 29 January 2016, available at: <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/in-theory/wp/2016/01/29/politicians-say-american-leadership-is-in-decline-theyre-wrong/>

²² JONES Deby, 'Ambassador Nick Burns speaks on America Foreign Policy Challenges', National Defence University, 28 August 2015, available at: <http://www.ndu.edu/News/Article-View/Article/618000/ambassador-nick-burns-speaks-on-americas-global-foreign-policy-challenges/>

past Hillary Clinton was in fact very closely aligned to Social Democrats, feminism and progressivism²³, but recent trends tend to consider her a Centrist Democrat.

FAPB and American foreign policy

In order to examine to what extent do member's opinions on key international agenda issues reflect Obama's foreign policy, the following provides an overview of the main ideas of the board. Among others, these issues —and the way the next president manages them— will determine U.S. leadership in the coming decades. Furthermore, the analysis includes Donald Trump and Hillary Clinton's views.

Syria, DAESH and Islamic terrorism

The fact that there are a limited number of options available about what course of action to follow in Syria has been a major headache for the U.S. administration. Broadly, most FAPB members oppose a strong military intervention led by the U.S., except Robert Kagan, who following the neoconservative agenda, argues that *'America will have to take the lead, provide the troops, supply the bulk of the air power and pull together those willing and able to join the effort'*²⁴. Others, such as Joseph Nye and Thomas Pickering, fear that putting American boots on the ground might have a very negative impact on the region. Both believe that any military intervention should be Sunni-led, since the sole presence of American or even Shiite soldiers in Syria might play into DAESH's recruitment tactics²⁵. Along these lines, some members back the strategy of arming indigenous forces, particularly Vali Nasr²⁶ and Stephen Hadley²⁷.

Many deem urgent the creation of a safe zone and a no-fly zone for Syrian refugees²⁸. Regarding the political future of the country, members of the FAPB are

²³ MARCO, op.cit., p.23

²⁴ Kagan Robert, 'The Crisis of World Order', Washington Post, 20 November 2015, available at: <http://www.wsj.com/articles/the-crisis-of-world-order-1448052095>

²⁵ NYE Joseph, 'How to Fight the Islamic State', Project Syndicate, 8 September 2015, available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/how-to-fight-the-islamic-state-by-joseph-s--nye-2015-09?barrier=true> and PICKERING Thomas, 'Dialogue: Ambassador Thomas Pickering', Idaho Public Television, Youtube, 21 February 2016, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EnpebiaT4QA>

²⁶ NASR Vali, 'Vali Nasr on Syria', VOA News, Youtube, 29 May 2013, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D1YFFRKUBY>

²⁷ HADLEY Stephen, 'Who is the US Supporting in Syria', CNN, Youtube, 5 September 2013, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uCbBQ5sr8co>

²⁸ BURNS Nicholas, 'Ambassador Nicholas Burns discusses Syria on the BBC World News', Hoover Institution, Youtube, 9 February 2016, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8gSha5sg14c> and BEAMON Todd, 'Negroponte warns against 'uncontrolled' Muslim immigration to Europe', Newsmax, 31 October 2015, available at: <http://www.newsmax.com/Newsfront/john-negroponte-syrian-refugees->

very divided about Assad's role in the transition. Some argue that after the number of human rights violations that he has committed he cannot remain in power in any way. For instance, Strobe Talbott claims that peace won't be an option if Assad is still in office and Stephen Hadley, neocon, even compares him with Saddam Hussein²⁹. On the other hand, Anne-Marie Slaughter considers that Assad should be part of the reconciliation process, because otherwise his absence would lead to a vacuum of power that extremist groups could take advantage of³⁰. Generally, a majority of the members agrees that the U.S. should continue to exert diplomatic and political pressure on the Syrian government, which suggest that they envision a long-term commitment with the country. Many favour Obama's foreign policy in Syria —with some restrictions— although they urge for more leadership in the region and for the creation of safe zones.

Donald Trump, despite his many declarations condemning the Iraq war, has argued for sending about 300000 troops to Syria in order to defeat DAESH. He is not reluctant to an increased Russian presence in the region and has always claimed that refugees should not be assumed by the U.S. but rather by neighbouring countries³¹. Moreover, he believes that the U.S. cannot be 'the policeman of the world', which implies that neither he seeks to reinforce leadership through military power nor he wants to increase the role of the U.S. in other countries' internal affairs. Kagan agrees that the U.S. should intervene militarily, but as opposed to Trump, he believes that the ultimate goal should be guaranteeing the U.S. hegemony within the current world order. On the other hand, Clinton supports the deployment of more troops and more air strikes but thinks that the initiative should come from local forces³², an idea that resonates with Vali Nasr and Stephen Hadley. She also asks for an increase in the number of refugees that the U.S. is taking.³³ Some members of the FAPB, such as John Negroponte, disagree with this and believe that neighbouring countries should be the ones to take the toll³⁴.

[europe/2015/10/31/id/699973/](http://www.iecee.es/europe/2015/10/31/id/699973/)

²⁹ HADLEY Stephen, 'A conversation on the Middle East with Stephen Hadley', SAIS Events, Youtube, 9 March 2015, available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r_7GbjBar14

³⁰ SLAUGHTER, Anne-Marie, 'Anne-Marie Slaughter on refugees and Syria', Channel 4 News, Youtube, 22 January 2016, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SDger-gC4vc>

³¹ MILLER Aaron D., 'Trump in the Middle East: Where does he really stand?', CNN, 20 March 2016, available at: <http://edition.cnn.com/2016/03/20/opinions/trump-aipac-meeting-miller/>

³² WONG Kristina, 'Clinton, Sanders support Syria deployment', The Hill, 26 March 2016, available at: <http://thehill.com/policy/defense/277643-clinton-sanders-support-syria-deployment>

³³ KAPLAN Rebecca, 'Hillary Clinton: US should take 65,000 refugees', CBS News, 20 September 2015, available at: <http://www.cbsnews.com/news/hillary-clinton-u-s-should-take-65000-syrian-refugees/>

³⁴ BEAMON Todd, 'Negroponte Warns Against 'Uncontrolled' Muslim Migration to Europe', Newsmax, 31 October 2015, available at: <http://www.newsmax.com/Newsfront/john-negroponte-syrian-refugees-europe/2015/10/31/id/699973/>

Russia and Ukraine

Most FAPB members have strongly condemned Russia's actions in Ukraine and they agree that Crimea's annexation was a 'surprise'³⁵. Robert Kagan is one of the few who ask for a stronger response on the part of the U.S. to Russia's attempt to reinstate its sphere of influence, although he does not clarify whether this should be a military response³⁶. Indeed, only Strobe Talbott argues for helping Ukraine military³⁷. In line with Nye's thinking, the majority of the FAPB believes that the solution lies in condemning Russia's actions in Ukraine while at the same time guaranteeing Russia's further engagement in the world affairs and thus preventing Putin's isolationism³⁸, since Russia is a key ally in regards to terrorism, Iran and climate change. Others point out that the European energetic dependence on Russia has acted as a catalyst of the crisis. For instance, Stephen Cheney thinks that the U.S. should increase its exports of liquefied natural gas to Europe in order to provide Europe with an alternative to kneeling before Putin³⁹.

The opinions expressed by FAPB are somewhat similar to Obama's official stance on Russia. On the other hand, Donald Trump has praised Putin's actions in Syria and has described him as a 'strong and brilliant leader', because Russian momentum in Syria actually benefits Trump's intention of 'absolving' the U.S. of any responsibility towards the Middle East⁴⁰. No member of the FAPB has referred to Putin in these terms. Meanwhile, if Hillary Clinton became president, she would definitely take a stronger stand on Putin⁴¹, who she has called a 'bully'⁴². William Burns, member of the FAPB, has recognised that Putin is 'aggressive'⁴³.

³⁵ HOGAN John, 'Jane Harman: responding to Russian aggression', Aspen Security Forum, available at: <http://aspensecurityforum.org/jane-harman-responding-to-russian-aggression/> and DONFRIED Karen, 'Karen Donfried on EU Sanctions & anti-Putin dissent inside Russia', VOA News, 3 October 2014, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5Di9GxV-MME>

³⁶ KAGAN Robert, 'United States must resist return to spheres of interest in the international system', Brookings, 19 February 2015, available at: <http://www.brookings.edu/blogs/order-from-chaos/posts/2015/02/19-united-states-must-resist-return-to-spheres-of-interest-international-system-kagan>

³⁷ TALBOTT Strobe et al, 'Preserving Ukraine's independence, resisting Russian aggression: what the United States and NATO must do', Brookings, February 2015, available at: <http://www.brookings.edu/research/reports/2015/02/ukraine-independence-russian-aggression>

³⁸ NYE Joseph, 'The challenge of Russia's decline', Project Syndicate, 14 April 2015, available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/russia-decline-challenge-by-joseph-s--nye-2015-04>

³⁹ CHENEY Stephen and HOLLAND Andrew, 'America's Chance to Help Break Russia's Energy Dominance', The Wall Street Journal, 22 February 2016, available at: <http://www.wsj.com/articles/americas-chance-to-help-break-russias-energy-dominance-1456169442>

⁴⁰ PALETTA Damian, 'Donald Trump goes his own way with Vladimir Putin', The Wall Street Journal, 13 May 2016, available at: <http://www.wsj.com/articles/donald-trump-goes-his-own-way-with-vladimir-putin-1463172396>

⁴¹ CLEMONS Stephen, 'Where Does Hillary Clinton Stand on China and Russia?', The Atlantic, 14 April 2015, available at: <http://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2015/04/where-does-hillary-clinton-stand-on-china-and-russia/390471/>

⁴² MCLAUGHLIN Kelly, 'It's... interesting!': Hillary Clinton explains her relationship with Vladimir Putin before

China's emergence and TPP's significance

Overall, the members believe that U.S. should find a way of cooperating with China and the Asia-Pacific region in the future. Carla Hill highlights that it is important to include both powers into the same treaties⁴⁴. The most influential treaty currently under negotiation in the region of Asia-Pacific is the TPP (Trans-Pacific Partnership), which excludes China. Nonetheless Jon Huntsman believes that the TPP—which in the U.S. is conceived as an instrument of soft power—will become increasingly more attractive to China despite the RCEP (Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership), the treaty to which it is already part of⁴⁵. Whereas Huntsman advocates for recognising China's geographical interests for the sake of international cooperation⁴⁶, Robert Kagan refuses to accept the Chinese sphere of influence and criticises the authoritarian soil on which the Chinese nation was built for not fitting in the current liberal order⁴⁷. There seems to be more of a consensus on condemning the cyber attacks that the Chinese government has apparently backed.

According to Joseph Nye, Barack Obama's strategy of replacing the word 'pivot' with 'rebalancing' in regards to Asia shows how the U.S. is accepting the role of China as a superpower⁴⁸. On the other hand, Donald Trump supports exhibiting more force and leadership and confronting China for manipulating its currency⁴⁹. Hillary Clinton would generally follow Obama's rebalancing strategy but she might be more assertive regarding human rights and the freedom of the Chinese population⁵⁰. Most FAPB members disagree with hardening the stance on China, since they consider that cooperation should be the basis of the relationship between both countries.

calling him a 'bully' during Democratic debate', Daily Mail, 18 January 2016, available at: <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-3404459/Hillary-Clinton-explains-relationship-Vladimir-Putin-calling-bully-Democratic-debate.html>

⁴³ BURNS William, 'Amb. Burns on Russia', John Hope Franklin Center at Duke University, YouTube, 29 April 2016, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qxuWYxZ7CZo>

⁴⁴ WEINMAN Karlee, 'Former U.S. trade rep urges better China policy', Finance & Commerce, 13 April 2015, available at: <http://finance-commerce.com/2015/04/former-u-s-trade-rep-urges-better-china-policy/#ixzz4CxVWv85R>

⁴⁵ HUNTSMAN Jon Jr., 'Nicholas Burns and Jon Huntsman: US China Relations and Foreign Policy', 92nd Street Y, Youtube, 2 February 2016, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Tg9JfHHLcFA>

⁴⁶ BREMMER Ian and HUNTSMAN Jon Jr., 'How to play well with China', The New York Times, 1 June 2013, available at: http://www.nytimes.com/2013/06/02/opinion/sunday/how-to-play-well-with-china.html?_r=0

⁴⁷ KAGAN Robert, 'United States must resist return to spheres of interest in the international system', op.cit.

⁴⁸ NYE Joseph, 'The old world's new roles', Project Syndicate, 10 July 2014, available at: <https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/joseph-s-nye-believes-that-europe-must-fulfill-some-key-responsibilities-vis-a-vis-a-rising-china>

⁴⁹ TRUMP Donald, 'Reforming the U.S.-China trade relationship to make America great again', Trump Make America Great Again, available at: <https://www.donaldjtrump.com/positions/us-china-trade-reform>

⁵⁰ FLORCRUZ Michelle, 'Where Hillary Clinton's China Policy Would Differ From President Obama's', Asia Society, 11 May 2016, available at: <http://asiasociety.org/blog/asia/where-hillary-clintons-china-policy-would-differ-president-obamas>

The future of the FAPB: Clinton or Trump?

Given the closeness of the U.S. presidential elections, it becomes essential to reflect on the political leanings of the members of the FAPB. While in the table at the end of the document the members are sorted into Democrats or Republicans, it is also interesting to further analyse their views on the two candidates.

Overall, members of the FAPB have showed their support for Hillary Clinton, which seems reasonable given that Democrats outnumber Republicans in a proportion 60-30% —there is no sufficient data to determine the affiliation of the remaining 10%. As a matter of fact, Nicholas Burns and Anne-Marie Slaughter have publicly supported Clinton. Indeed, others have strongly opposed Trump's candidacy, both in interviews and social media. Statements have been particularly harsh and have come from both parties. Robert Kagan has claimed that Trump will bring fascism into the US⁵¹, while Joseph Nye recently tweeted that Trump was an 'ignorant fool'⁵². Only Jon Huntsman Jr. has supported Trump, despite opposing him at the beginning of the presidential campaign, and he has even praised his ability to unify views and overcome internal divisions⁵³.

A priori, the political ideas of the members of the FAPB are the complete opposite to Trump's isolationism, also taking into account his most controversial statements. What this opposition shows is perhaps a reflection of a deeper ideological fragmentation in the U.S. society, given that since 9/11 the general sentiment went from optimism to defeat and thus planted a seed for Trump's discourse to succeed. From the very beginning, Trump has used the same arguments that had already been employed by Democrats to criticise neoconservatives, but ideologically he has taken a much more isolationist stance that evokes U.S. behaviour before the world wars. Within the Republican Party he has ferociously attacked neocons and the Bush legacy. Despite his many controversies, such as imposing a ban on Muslims entering the U.S. to fight terrorism and building a wall in the border with Mexico to prevent crime, Trump has reopened the debate on U.S. hegemony in the world.

What is really interesting about Trump's ideology is that it is influenced by many different ideas that are not limited to the Republican Party. In fact, some studies suggest that Trump is at the left of Democrats regarding issues such as the U.S. role

⁵¹ KAGAN Robert, 'This is how fascism comes to America', Brookings, 22 May 2016, available at: <http://www.brookings.edu/blogs/order-from-chaos/posts/2016/05/22-trump-fascism-in-america-kagan>

⁵² NYE, Joseph, Twitter, 3 April 2016, available at: https://twitter.com/joe_nye/status/716734366295175168

⁵³ SNEED Tierney, 'Jon Huntsman Calls Out #NeverTrump: It's Time To Rally Around Donald Trump', TMP, 2 May 2016, available at: <http://talkingpointsmemo.com/livewire/huntsman-donald-trump>

as a superpower and protector of the world order⁵⁴. Paleoconservadurism has also influenced Trump's thinking, specifically in respect of border security, economic nationalism and military intervention, to which paleoconservatives were very sceptical⁵⁵. Other significant studies show that Trump's ideology is actually based on a certain 'ideological moderation', which does not mean that he cannot have extremist views on certain aspects⁵⁶. As opposed to the neoconservatism of the Bush administration and Obama's liberalism, the absence of a clear ideology along with some patriotism would better define Trump, who does not subscribe exclusively to any particular ideology.

In this light, most members of the FAPB have reflected on the U.S. position in the world. Some ideas are worth mentioning for they can be of use when it comes to asserting U.S. dominance—or reducing it. Many have highlighted that the U.S. should be the sole guarantor of world order, although they differ in defining how this role should come about. For instance, Robert Kagan believes that the U.S. has the responsibility to defend its core values and the liberal order because of its status as a superpower⁵⁷, just as a neocon would argue, although he is certainly more timid because of the failures of the war on terror. Nonetheless, he defends increasing U.S. military strength. Huntsman also thinks that the U.S. should stand up for certain values, which in his eyes it is not the same as launching a preventive war like in Iraq⁵⁸.

Nicholas Burns warns of the risks of living in a no-polar world with an unstable balance of power⁵⁹, so he argues for restoring U.S. leadership in the world through a combination of the following instruments: political, military, economic and soft power. William Burns also points out that in the future diplomacy should be backed by military force and not the other way around⁶⁰. Michael Mullen agrees with Burns that

⁵⁴ KRAUTHAMMER Charles, 'The GOP's Ideological Earthquake and the Aftermath', National Review, 5 May 2016, available at: <http://www.nationalreview.com/article/435045/donald-trump-not-conservative-gop-doesnt-care>

⁵⁵ PFEIFFER Alex, 'Pat Buchanan: Even If Trump Wins, The West Is Doomed', Daily Caller, 19 April 2016, available at: <http://dailycaller.com/2016/04/19/pat-buchanan-even-if-trump-wins-the-west-is-doomed/#ixzz4CWxzUqDF>

⁵⁶ AHLER Doug y BROOCKMAN David, 'Donald Trump is a textbook example of an ideological moderate', The Washington Post, 16 December 2015, available at: <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/monkey-cage/wp/2015/12/16/donald-trump-is-a-textbook-example-of-an-ideological-moderate/>

⁵⁷ KAGAN Robert, 'Superpowers don't get to retire', op.cit.

⁵⁸ HUNTSMAN Jon Jr., 'Stop the Politics on Syria', Financial Times, 31 August 2013, available at: <https://next.ft.com/content/20a4bbb8-1225-11e3-9bcd-00144feabdc0>

⁵⁹ JONES Deby, op.cit.

⁶⁰ BURNS William J., 'We Asked William J. Burns: What Should Be the Purpose of American Power?', The National Interest, 24 August 2015, available at: <http://nationalinterest.org/feature/we-asked-william-j-burns-what-should-be-the-purpose-american-13657>

force should not be employed alone even in cases where it is the first option⁶¹. Therefore, Nye's soft power theory becomes especially relevant.

Yet if Trump gets elected, the FAPB membership might get renewed in order to eliminate dissenting voices, especially taking into account that many members have strongly opposed Trump's participation in politics. Even within the Republicans, neocons subscribe to an ideology that has nothing in common with Trump's ideas. The continuity of the FAPB is thus called into question, since some members might resign and others may not be to the liking of Trump.

Conclusion: the future of the FAPB

The U.S. primaries between Clinton and Trump come in a very particular moment for the country, shaped by the failure of neoconservatives and the general perception that Obama's liberalism-centrism is not enough. Trump's ideas have found a nest in a progressively more fragmented society that has become so because of the burden of being the first superpower of the world. The Republican billionaire has built his success on the escalation of the war in Syria and the attacks in Paris in Brussels, and has used them as a tool to promoting a protectionist policy that seeks more border restrictions, which finds its European counterpart in Brexit and far-right movements. The partition into two U.S. or two Europes as a result of the boom of populism is a potential future risk that should be taken into account. Internally, the social polarisation between Democrats and Republicans has widened and the nomination of Trump is unparalleled regarding how astonished it has left academia.

The FAPB, made up of some of the most renowned academics and politicians, has strongly criticised Trump's rise into power, although not everyone has publicly backed Clinton. However, it is important to keep examining the weight of the ideas present in this board, for they constitute an accurate expression of some of the most influential schools of thought nowadays. We shall have to wait and see if the response from the part of liberals in academia and government is robust enough to put an end to scepticism and isolationism.

i

*Cristina Ariza Cerezo**
Universidad Pontificia de Comillas

⁶¹ Mullen, Michael G., 'Admiral Mullen's Speech on Military Strategy, Kansas State University, March 2010', Council of Foreign Relations, 3 March 2010, available at: <http://www.cfr.org/defense-strategy/admiral-mullens-speech-military-strategy-kansas-state-university-march-2010/p21590>

Annex 1

	Education ⁶²	University	Employment	Institutions	Expertise	Leanings
Burns, Nicholas	BA History MA International Relations	Boston College John Hopkins Paul H. Nitze School of Advanced International Studies (SAIS)	Ambassador Government Academia	<u>Aspen Strategy Group, Atlantic Council, CFR⁶³, Harvard Kennedy School, Trilateral Commission, Special Olympics</u>	Diplomacy, foreign policy, Middle East, Asia, Russia, Ukraine.	Democrat. Bill Clinton, George H.W Bush
Burns, William J	BA History MA and DPhil International Relations	La Salle Oxford	Ambassador Think Tank	President <u>Carnegie Endowment for International Peace</u>	Diplomacy, Foreign policy, Russia, Eurasia, South Asia	Both, more Democrat Warren Christopher, Madeleine Albright
Carson, Johnnie	BA History and Political Science MA International Relations	Drake University School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) London	Ambassador Government	<i>No data</i>	Africa, Iran	Democrat Barack Obama
Cheney, Stephen A.	Brigadier General	US Naval Academy Marine Corps Command and Staff College, University Southern California	Military Think Tank Government	CEO <u>American Security Project, CFR</u>	Artillery, Japan, Middle East and Asia	Republican Dick Cheney, Les Aspin
Cunningham, Nelson W	Law magna cum laude	Yale	Lawyer Government	President <u>American Security Project, Atlantic Council, CFR, Mc Larty Associates, Council of the Americas</u>	International Law, the West.	Democrat Bill Clinton, John Kerry, Joseph Biden, Barack Obama
Donfried, Karen	BA Government and German MA/ PhD Law and Diplomacy MA	Wesleyan University Tufts University University de Munich	Government Think tank	President German Marshall Fund of the US, <u>CFR</u>	German Foreign and Defence Policy, European integration, Transatlantic link	Democrat Barack Obama
Finucane,	BA English and	University of	Economist	Bank of	Marketing,	Democrat

⁶² Abbreviations are explained as follows: BA = Bachelor of Arts, BS = Bachelor of Science, MA= Master in Arts, MLitt= Master of Letters, MPhil= Master in Philosophy, PhD/DPhil= Doctor of Philosophy, JD= Juris Doctor.

⁶³ CFR = Council of Foreign Relations

Anne M	Art	New Hampshire		America, <u>CFR</u> , <u>Special Olympics</u>	business, women	
Hadley, Stephen, J	J.D Law Law magna cum laude Phi Beta Kappa	Yale Cornell	Lawyer Government	<u>Carnegie Endowment for International Peace</u>	Iraq, War on terror, Middle East Russia, Nuclear weapons,	Republican George W Bush, Dick Cheney, Condoleezza Rice
Harman, Jane	Law magna cum laude Phi Beta Kappa	Smith College Harvard	Government Think Tank	Wilson Center, <u>Aspen Institute</u>	Homeland security, intelligence, domestic policy	Democrat Jimmy Carter
Hills, Carla A	Law	Yale Stanford	Ambassador Private Sector	President <u>Hills & Company</u> , <u>CFR</u> , <u>Trilateral Commission</u>	Economy, free trade, US- Japan relation	Republican George H.W. Bush, Gerard R Ford
Huntsman, Jr, Jon	BA International Politics	University of Pennsylvania	Government Ambassador Think Tank	Secretary <u>Atlantic Council</u>	China, climate change, US leadership	Republican Ronald Reagan, George H Bush
Kagan, Robert	BA History Master Public Policy PhD History	Yale Harvard American University	Government Journalism Think Tank	<u>Brookings Institution</u> , <u>Project New American Century</u> , <u>CFR</u>	Foreign Policy, Russia, China, EU, NATO, Balkans, Iraq	Republican George W Bush, John McCain
Kurtzer, Daniel C	BA Political Science MA/ MPhil Comparative Politics and Middle East PhD Political Science	Yeshiva University Columbia University	Ambassador Academia	Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs.	Middle East, Egypt and Israel	Democrat Barack Obama
Mullen, Michael	Navy admiral	United States Naval Academy	Military	Sprint Nextel Corp	War strategy, war operations	Both
Nasr, Vali	BA International Relations MA Economy and Middle East PhD Political Science	Tufts University Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy Massachusetts Institute of Technology	Academia Think Tank Government	Paul H. Nitze School of Advanced International Studies (SAIS), Tufts University, <u>CFR</u> , <u>Brookings Institution</u>	Evolution social movements in the Islamic world Afghanistan, Pakistan, Iran	Democrat Ambassador Richard Holbrooke
Negroponte, John	BA Law	Yale Harvard	Ambassador Government Academia	<u>Mc Larty Associates</u> , Intelligence and National Security Alliance	Central and South America, Vietnam, Honduras	Republican Richard Nixon, Ronald Reagan, George W. Bush
Nye, Joseph S	BA Philosophy,	Princeton Oxford	Academia Government	<u>Aspen Strategy Group</u> , <u>CFR</u>	Asia, diplomacy,	Democrat

	Politics and Economy PhD Political Science	Harvard		<u>Harvard Kennedy School</u>	Europe, foreign policy, intelligence, nuclear weapons, terrorism	Hillary Clinton
Pickering, Thomas R	BA History MA MA	Bowdoin College Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy University of Melbourne	Ambassador Military	<u>Hills & Company, Aspen Institute, CFR, United States Institute for Peace</u>	United Nations, Iraq	Both/ Republican William P Rogers, Henri Kissinger, Ronald Reagan, Bill Clinton, George H.W. Bush
Slaughter, Anne Marie	BA Europe MPhil/DPhil International Relations JD. Law	Princeton Oxford Harvard	Academic Think Tank Government	President New America, <u>The Atlantic</u>	Education, women, world order foreign policy.	Democrat Hillary Clinton
Susman, Louis B	BA Law	University of Michigan Washington University	Ambassador Lawyer Private Sector	Citigroup, Thompson & Mitchell	Banking, acquisitions, corporate law, finance	Democrat Ronald Reagan, Barack, Obama
Talbott, Strobe	BA/MA Mlitt	Yale University Oxford	Journalist Think Tank Government	President <u>Brookings Institution, Carnegie Endowment, Aspen Strategy Group, CFR, Time</u>	US Foreign Policy, Europe, Russia, South Asia and control of nuclear weapons	Democrat Bill Clinton
Valley, Thomas J	BS MA Public Administration	University of Massachusetts /Boston Harvard John. F. Kennedy School	Academia Government	Ash Centre for Democratic Governance and Innovation, <u>Harvard Kennedy School</u>	South Asia, Vietnam	<i>No data</i>
Wade David	Politics	Brown University	Government	<i>No data</i>	Political strategy	Democrat John Kerry's right-hand man, personal friendship.

***NOTA:** Las ideas contenidas en los **Documentos de Opinión** son de responsabilidad de sus autores, sin que reflejen, necesariamente, el pensamiento del IEEE o del Ministerio de Defensa.